

1	IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF ARIZONA		
2	IN AND FOR THE COUNTY OF YAVAPAI		
3	JEANNE HICKS, Clerk CY		
4	THE STATE OF ARIZONA,		
5	Plaintiff,)		
6	vs.) No. CR 2008-1339		
7	STEVEN CARROLL DEMOCKER,		
8	Defendant.)		
9			
10			
11	BEFORE: THE HONORABLE THOMAS B. LINDBERG JUDGE OF THE SUPERIOR COURT		
12	DIVISION SIX YAVAPAI COUNTY, ARIZONA		
13	TAVAFAI COUNTI, ARIZONA		
14	PRESCOTT, ARIZONA		
15	THURSDAY, JUNE 10, 2010 8:56 A.M 11:56 A.M.		
16			
17	REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS		
18	JURY TRIAL		
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24	ROXANNE E. TARN, CR Certified Court Reporter		
25	Certificate No. 50808		

INDEX	
PROCEEDINGS	PAGE
TESTIMONY	
	PAGE
CANDICE ACTON	9
Cross-examination by Mr. Sears	31
Questions by the Jury	54 67
Follow-up questions by Mr. Butner Follow-up questions by Mr. Sears	76 76
SCOTT JOY Direct examination by Mr. Butner	81
	PROCEEDINGS TESTIMONY CANDICE ACTON Direct examination resumed by Mr. Butner Cross-examination by Mr. Sears Redirect examination by Mr. Butner Questions by the Jury Follow-up questions by Mr. Butner Follow-up questions by Mr. Sears SCOTT JOY

1	APPEARANCES
2	
3	On Behalf of the State:
4	Mr. Joseph Butner and Mr. Jeffrey Paupore
5	Yavapai County Attorney's Office
6	On Behalf of the Defendant:
7	
8	Mr. John Sears P.O. Box 4080
9	Prescott, AZ 86302
10	Mr. Larry Hammond and Ms. Anne Chapman Osborn Maledon, P.A.
11	2929 North Central Ave., 21st Floor Phoenix, AZ 85012
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

(Whereupon, the following was held in open court out of the presence of the jury.)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE COURT: Record reflects the jury is not in the room. The defendant and his lead attorney, Mr. Sears, are in the room. Mr. Paupore and Mr. Butner are here, as well.

I wanted to let you know I got some questions from the jury, and I let you look at some of them -- most of them yesterday, last night. I got two more this morning. One is something other than factual for this It is from Mr. Lopez that says, "I, Jose Dario witness. Lopez, ask for permission to have half day court on June 23rd, which is two weeks from yesterday, for the purpose of taking my two older sons to the airport to travel to Chicago, Illinois. I tried to book another date or later on that date, but did not have two seats. My boys are 11 and 7 years Never traveled alone before, and because of the trial they will this time. It is not that I am complaining, but it would be great if we can switch Monday for Wednesday on that week. Consider my petition. Thanks. Jose D. Lopez."

For what it is worth, for you to think about anyway. I don't know that I need a response at this point.

MR. SEARS: Judge, we would like an opportunity to talk among the defense side about Mr. Lopez.

We have been thinking about the degree to which Mr. Lopez has been advising the Court of the problems that his jury service is causing. And this is another one. I am going to need an opportunity to talk to the rest of the team.

about the record, or lack of record we are making on juror notes. My appellate friends would be pulling their hair out over the unrecorded bench conferences, particularly the ones about the notes. I don't know a better way to do that without delaying the trial. I am a little bit accustomed to doing all of the discussion about juror questions during deliberations on the record for sure, and I just don't know what your thoughts are about doing that, doing some version of that. I just have the sense we are not making a complete record about juror questions, and when we come out --

making is, and this is why I don't have -- even in most trials, including this one -- I don't have the court reporter come out every time we have jury questions or side bars, because I have found that most of the time the lawyers are in agreement that a question is improper or a question is proper. And it is only when you wish to make a record, when there is some disagreement about that, that we have Roxanne come over.

MR. SEARS: I think we have been doing that.

I am not completely comfortable that that is an adequate 1 2 record in a case this important on all questions. If you are not objecting, then 3 THE COURT: 4 there is no record that needs to be made. If you are 5 objecting, then I will bring her over. 6 MR. SEARS: Maybe that is a way to do that. 7 THE COURT: We will do that. In general, even 8 so far in this trial, my experience has been the Court and 9 the lawyers seem to agree 90-percent or better of the time on 10 whether a question is proper or not proper. And I will let 11 you make your record at opportune moments, if there is some 12 disagreement about that. Sometimes there is, and I 13 understand that. 14 MR. BUTNER: Not very much. 15 THE COURT: Not very much. 16 MR. PAUPORE: Excuse me, Your Honor. 17 go back to Mr. Lopez for a moment? 18 THE COURT: Sure. MR. PAUPORE: I don't know if the Court heard 19 20 yesterday when the discussion was -- the question was how far 21 the light switch was off the floor in the hallway. I heard a 22 voice from the jury, "four feet." Rhonda, our paralegal said 23 Mr. Lopez said that. I heard --24 MR. BUTNER: I did, too.

MR. PAUPORE: I didn't know it was him.

heard someone blurt out it was four feet. It came right from 1 2 where he was, but I did not see him say it. 3 MR. BUTNER: I was not looking in that 4 direction, too. MR. PAUPORE: I want to add that to the mix of 5 6 Mr. Lopez, I guess, for Mr. Sears' benefit. 7 THE COURT: I didn't hear it, and it didn't 8 get on the record as far as I know. 9 I did get one other factual related 10 question. I think you all took a look at the factually 11 related questions for this witness, and you are welcome to 12 look at the most recent one I received. It is short of War 13 and Peace, but not by very much. 14 (Whereupon, a discussion was held off the record.) 15 (Whereupon, the jury enters the courtroom.) THE COURT: Record reflects the presence of 16 17 the jury, the defendant, the defense counsel and prosecution 18 team. 19 Sergeant Acton is still on the stand and 20 undergoing direct examination. 21 Good morning. Obviously, you are still 22 under oath. 23 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir. 24 THE COURT: Thank you. 25 Mr. Butner.

MR. BUTNER: Judge, I think that Mr. Sears and I have reached a stipulation concerning a number of photographs of the scene at 7485 Bridle Path. The State is offering Exhibits No. 2320 through 2336, and the defense is offering exhibits numbered --MR. SEARS: 2315 through 2319. MR. BUTNER: And we stipulate and agree that these may be admitted into evidence at this time. THE COURT: Agreed? MR. SEARS: That's correct, Your Honor. THE COURT: Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, Exhibits 2315, inclusive, through 2336 are admitted. MR. BUTNER: And we also stipulate and agree, Judge, that Exhibits 2337 and 2338 may be admitted into evidence at this time. MR. SEARS: Both of them are portions of a larger exhibit, 2315. THE COURT: I will order then admitting 2337 and 2338. So all exhibits from 2315 up through 2338 are admitted. Thank you, Judge. MR. BUTNER: CANDICE ACTON, called previously as a witness, having been duly sworn, testified further as follows:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 DIRECT EXAMINATION RESUMED 2 BY MR. BUTNER: 3 Sergeant Acton, you indicated that you were Q. Okay. 4 just getting ready to start looking at the Granite Oaks 5 subdivision as part of your investigation; is that correct? That's correct. 6 Α. 7 Before we go to Granite Oaks, I would like to go 8 through some more photographs of the crime scene at Bridle 9 Path, so we can get a clearer picture of how you entered and so forth. 10 11 Α. Okay. 12 Let me show you what was marked as Exhibit 2320. Q. 13 Do you recognize what is depicted in that 14 exhibit? 15 Yes, I do. Α. What is it, please? 16 Q. 17 Α. That's the south side glass door. 18 Are those the doors through which you entered that Q. night when you began your sweep of the residence? 19 20 Yes, it was. Α. 21 0. And are those the doors in which the dogs were 22 located? 23 Α. Yes, it was. 24 Q. Could you see the dogs through the doors?

Yes, I could, down in this area.

25

Α.

1 Q. And then let me show you what is marked as Exhibit 2 No. 2322. 3 Do you recognize what is depicted in that 4 exhibit? 5 Α. Yes, I do. 6 Okay. And what is it? 7 That is the south door that is open here. This is 8 where we made entry, coming into the dining room area. 9 kitchen would be over in this area here. 10 So those are those double glass doors on the left Q. 11 in this photograph? 12 Α. Yes, sir. 13 Q. And they are in an opened state at that point; 14 right? 15 Α. Yes. 16 Let me show you what has been marked as Exhibit Q. 2323. 17 What is depicted in that exhibit? 18 That's the island in the kitchen. Right here is 19 Α. 20 the center island. Over here is the dining room. 21 hallway -- if you curve around here, this leads to the 22 hallway here. There is a little closet over here. 23 Q. Is that a closet that you checked when you entered 24 the residence?

25

Α.

Yes, it is.

1	Q. What is that lighted area adjacent to the closet?
2	A. Another door.
3	Q. Is that the door that goes out the north side of
4	the residence toward the garage?
5	A. Yes.
6	Q. And then the hallway down which you proceeded is
7	located where?
8	A. Right in that area here.
9	Q. Going off to the right in this photo?
10	A. Yes.
11	Q. Let me show you what is admitted into evidence as
12	exhibit well, show you what has been marked as Exhibit
13	2321.
14	What is depicted in this photograph,
15	please?
16	A. The kitchen area, again with the island here.
17	Also dining room over here. And heading around this way
18	would be going down towards the hallway.
19	Q. Okay. Let me show you what is admitted into
20	evidence as Exhibit 2324.
21	Do you recognize what is depicted in that
22	exhibit?
23	A. A light switch.
24	Q. Do you recognize that particular light switch?
25	A. Yes, I do.

1	Q.	Where is that light switch located?
2	А.	It is in the hallway. It was opposite where the
3	victim was	lying.
4	Q.	That doorway to the left there, is that the
5	doorway to	the master bedroom?
6	Α.	This area right here you are talking about?
7	Q.	Correct.
8	Α.	Yes. That is going to the master bedroom.
9	Q.	And this light switch is located directly across
10	the hall f:	rom the entrance to the office where Carol
11	Kennedy's 1	oody was found?
12	Α.	Yes.
13	Q.	What's significant about this particular light
14	switch?	
15	Α.	If you look up in this if you look at that area
16	right there	e, there is a piece of blood spatter right there.
17	Q.	Was that blood in a smeared condition when you
18	observed i	t?
19	А.	No, it was not.
20	Q.	Did anybody touch that particular piece of blood
21	spatter?	
22	Α.	No one touched it while I was there.
23	Q.	And it was photographed as you discovered it?
24	Α.	Yes.
25	Q.	This picture accurately depicts it?

1 A. Yes, it does. 2 MR. BUTNER: Phil walked out, Judge, and I 3 need to put this thing back up. Maybe I should peak out 4 there and ask him to come in. 5 THE COURT: You can do that. 6 BY MR. BUTNER: 7 Okay. Let me show you what's been marked as 0. 8 Exhibit 2325. 9 Do you recognize what is depicted in that 10 particular photograph? 11 Α. Yes, I do. 12 What is it? 0. 13 Α. This is the desk right here, blood coming down 14 here, and the victim is here. 15 Q. And these protruding objects here from the desk, 16 what are those? Do you know? 17 Α. That was used to hold up this piece of like a 18 silver colored molding that was attached there. 19 Q. Is that molding laying in close proximity to the 20 victim's body? 21 Α. Yes, it is. 22 THE COURT: Mr. Butner, be cautious about the 23 jurors behind you, please. 24 MR. BUTNER: Sorry. Thanks, Judge.

Let me show you what has been marked as Exhibit

25

Q.

1	2326.	
2		Do you recognize what is depicted in that
3	exhibit?	
4	Α.	Some sort of athletic shoe.
5	Q.	Do you remember seeing that athletic shoe?
6	Α.	Yes, I do.
7	Q.	Where did you see it?
8	Α.	On the victim here.
9	Q.	That was on Carol Kennedy's foot; is that correct?
10	Α.	That's correct, sir.
11	Q.	Let me show you what has been admitted as Exhibit
12	No. 2327.	
13		Do you recognize what is depicted in that
14	exhibit?	
15	Α.	Yes, I do.
16	Q.	What is it?
17	Α.	This is the entrance here coming down the hallway,
18	the ladder	laying on top of the door here, the desk here, a
19	victim here	e. This is the checkbook over here. There is a
20	cell phone	right here.
21	Q.	What is the object right here in the forefront?
22	Α.	It appears to be part of that bookshelf that was
23	toppled ove	er.
24	Q.	Is this the way that that room looked when you
25	entered on	July the 2nd of the year 2008?

1 Α. Yes, except for this door was shut. 2 Let me show you what is marked and admitted in 3 evidence as Exhibit 2329. 4 Tell us what is depicted in that exhibit. 5 Right here is the hallway again. Here is those Α. 6 plastic Tupperware containers here that are sitting at the 7 end of the hallway. The ladder again here. This is the desk 8 area right here, and the door that is open right here. 9 At some point in time was the light turned on in 0. 10 the office area when you were there? 11 Not that I recall. Α. 12 Were you able to see blood spatter located on the 0. 13 top surface of the desk? 14 Α. Right in this area here at the corner. 15 Q. Did you see it anyplace else on the desk? 16 No, not that I recall. Α. 17 Q. It was dark in there when you were in there? 18 It was dark. I was using my flashlight, and it Α. wasn't until later on when I could light up the hallway that 19 20 I actually got to see a little more, so that was it. 21 Let me show you what is admitted into evidence as 22 Exhibit 2328. 23 What is depicted in this particular 24 photograph?

Here's the hallway. Here's the plastic storage

25

Α.

1 containers. The ladder up against the door. This is the 2 closet area here. There is a bookshelf right here that is knocked over, and this is the desk area here, the computer 3 4 desk. 5 I see some little white spots or patches of some 0. 6 sort on the victim's body. Do you know how those got there? 7 Α. They were placed there by EMS. 8 When they responded and checked her vital signs? 9 I called them to the scene and escorted them Α. Yes. 10 in and observed them put them on her. 11 Let me show you what has been admitted as Exhibit Q. 12 2330. 13 Tell us what is depicted in that 14 particular exhibit, please. 15 Α. The view from the hallway here, standing in the 16 door. Here's again the computer desk here. There is a 17 checkbook right here. The ladder again on top of the door. 18 This bookshelf that has been knocked over. Another one, a bookshelf that was also knocked over a little bit. 19 20 Did you see any blood spatter on the bookshelf? 21 No, I did not. Α. 22 Let me show you what has been admitted into 23 evidence as Exhibit 2331. 24 What is depicted in that particular 25 photograph?

1	A. This is the bookshelf, again, that is knocked over
2	here. Computer desk here. Door going out this way. And the
3	hallway door would be over in this area. There is the cell
4	phone and the checkbook here.
5	Q. Were you in this office, crime scene area, during
6	the daylight hours at all?
7	A. Never.
8	Q. So the entire time that you were there, the only
9	illumination that you had was your flashlight?
10	A. A flashlight.
11	Q. Or somebody else's flashlight?
12	A. Until at one point when I turned on the hallway
13	light later on, so I could see a little bit better in that
14	area.
15	Q. Let me show you what is admitted into evidence as
16	Exhibit 2333.
17	And what is depicted in that particular
18	exhibit?
19	A. This is the bookshelf here, the first one that is
20	knocked over into this one. The second bookshelf, which is
21	knocked back into the wall.
22	Q. Let me show you what has been admitted into
23	evidence as Exhibit 2332.
24	What is depicted in this particular
25	photograph?

1	A. If you come in, the hallway is over here. The	
2	door where I entered is on this side, and you are looking up	р
3	into the loft area here.	
4	Q. Is that the area that you cleared or Sergeant Jos	У
5	cleared before you proceeded with the examination of the boo	dy
6	of the victim, Carol Kennedy?	
7	A. Yes. Scott Joy and I went in there and cleared	
8	that as best we could.	
9	Q. These two little black things here, what are	
10	those?	
11	A. These items here are where the rungs for the	
12	ladder was on the door.	
13	Q. So the ladder hooked onto those in some fashion?	
14	A. Correct. The ladder hooked onto that.	
15	Q. And this particular area right back here that I	an
16	pointing to, what is that?	
17	A. It looks like a window.	
18	Q. Do you remember that window back there?	
19	A. No, I don't.	
20	Q. Let me show you what has been admitted into	
21	evidence as Exhibit 2334.	
22	What is depicted in that particular	
23	photograph?	
24	A. This item right here was the checkbook.	
25	Q. Is that where it was located when you discovered	

the body in that room? 1 2 Α. Yes. 3 Thank you. You can resume --0. 4 MR. SEARS: Could I have the last number, 5 Counsel? 6 MR. BUTNER: 2334. 7 MR. SEARS: Thank you. 8 BY MR. BUTNER: 9 Q. Okay. Let's talk about when you were going to start looking in the Granite Oaks subdivision. 10 11 Before we get to that, you were calling 12 that telephone that was laying in the office a cell phone. 13 Was it a cell phone, or was it one of those kinds of phones 14 that you can walk away from, and it is a cordless phone. 15 Α. I need to correct myself. It is a cordless phone, 16 yes. 17 Okay. You indicated that after Deputy Taintor and 18 then you both went over and spoke with Mr. Drake, that then 19 you decided that you would take the investigation over, as 20 you put it, to the Granite Oaks subdivision; is that correct? 21 Α. Yes. That's correct. 22 0. Okay. And would you explain to us where the 23 Granite Oaks subdivision is located relative to the Bridle Path address? 24 25 It would be just the next development north of Α.

there.

- Q. Got that laser pointer? Would you show us on this map basically where the Granite Oaks subdivision is located.
- A. Right here is Glenshandra coming off of Williamson Valley Road here. This is the first road that runs into Granite Oaks subdivision, Royal Oaks subdivision. This is the first road that is on the south side. All of this is Granite Oaks subdivision. All of the roads up here leading north are all part of this Granite Oaks subdivision here. Glenshandra is the southern road of that subdivision.
- Q. When you took the investigation to the Granite Oaks subdivision, then where did you go?
- A. Initially came in here. Went down probably about almost towards the end, slowly moving through here. Stopped the vehicles on the pavement. It was myself and Deputy Taintor. And we were just looking around the area here. It was dark that night. We are just driving around.
- Q. Would you show us the route that you took to get to the Granite Oaks subdivision?
 - A. Okay.
 - Q. To the best that you can with that map.
- A. Here's the residence here. Going down Bridle Path here. Eventually turned up and went on Single Tree, right here. And that leads back over to Williamson Valley heading northbound, and then turning east on Glenshandra driving down

here.

- Q. And are there other ways to get into the Bridle
 Path residence besides Bridle Path itself off of Williamson
 Valley and then Single Tree that you described?
- A. Yes, there is. There is another way here. If this is Bridle Path here, it dead ends, and it does a 90 degree turn. This is Jockey Path, I am pretty sure. You follow this back around over here, and you have got to make a bunch of lefts and rights. And eventually you end up on this little dirt road. It is called Shane. And it comes back out on Williamson Valley back in here, and you can take it back north.
- Q. Are there any other ways that you can get in there?
 - A. Not with a vehicle, that I am aware of.
- Q. So anyway, you proceeded down to Single Tree and cut over to Williamson Valley and then back up to Glenshandra Drive?
 - A. Yes, I did.
- Q. Can you drive a more direct route from Bridle Path to Glenshandra Drive than the one that you took?
- A. It is either Glenshandra or going down and coming off of Shane Road, either one of those.
- Q. And yet approximately how far from the Bridle Path residence is that trailhead at the end of Glenshandra?

1 Α. Residence is here. Trailhead is here. 2 So straight up the fence line? Q. 3 Going straight north. Α. 4 Do you know what that distance is between Bridle 5 Path and that trailhead? 6 Α. No, I do not. 7 Anyway, that is where you went that night; is that Q. 8 correct? 9 Yes, I did. Α. 10 Q. You drove down Glenshandra Drive, and what were 11 you looking for going down Glenshandra? 12 I'm looking for anything that stands out. I'm 13 looking for vehicles. I'm looking for people. Anything 14 suspicious that might catch my eye. It is in the middle of 15 the night. Things are relatively quiet in this neighborhood. 16 I get out of my vehicle. I start walking around. 17 listening, looking, shining my flashlight to see if anything 18 stands out. It is pretty quiet there at that time of night. 19 Did you see anything that struck you as standing 0. 20 out or out of the ordinary while you were doing this? 21 No, nothing really stood out. Α. 22 Ultimately, did you end up at the end of Q. 23 Glenshandra Drive? 24 Α. I worked my way down, walking around, walked

down here and I came to the very end here. There is a fence

line running north and south here and a gate. 2 Q. Okay. Sometimes you do get lucky. Please resume 3 the stand. 4 Let me show you what is admitted into 5 evidence as Exhibit 2229. 6 Do you recognize what is depicted in that 7 particular exhibit? 8 Yes, I do. This is the end of Glenshandra Drive. Α. 9 That is crime scene tape; right? 10 Α. All the yellow is crime scene tape, and I recall 11 putting that up, yes. 12 Is that right? You are one of the people that put 0. 13 that up? 14 Yes, I did. 15 When you got to this location at the end of 16 Glenshandra Drive, would you describe the area for us, 17 please. 18 Okay. So up here at the end of Glenshandra, down Α. 19 here -- I don't know if you can see -- but you are looking 20 directly straight in front of you. The pavement ends back in

this area. This is all dirt, gravel area. It is maybe, I

want to say, 25, 30 feet this way, maybe 30, 40 feet this

way. This is a residential area. There is houses on this

four-strand barbed wire fence, a metal post, T-post going

side, houses on this side. Along this way, there is a

21

22

23

24

1 here. A couple of reflective signs in the middle. This is a 2 3 4 5 Q. 6 7 those? 8 Α. 9 or so. 10 Not as high as a human being? Q. 11 Α. No. 12 13 14 15 this way. 16 17 there anybody with you, the trailhead area there? 18 Deputy Taintor went over there with me. Α. 19 What time of the day or night was it, 0. 20 approximately? 21 Α. 22

23

24

25

Q.

Α.

Q.

Yes, sir.

gate area here. Gate is maybe three or four feet wide. had a padlock on it. It was locked. This fence line continues up this way, barbed wire fence going that way. Those reflective stanchions that are in the forefront on the photograph, approximately how high are I'm not sure. I want to say like four feet high And this picture makes everything look really gigantic, and it is really not that big of an area. a residential street, which is usually 22 feet or so wide. Like I said, this area is only maybe 30 feet by 30, 40 feet And when you got to the Glenshandra area, was I don't know exactly what time it is, but it is probably around eleven o'clock or so, maybe a little later.

And obviously it was dark then?

What did you have to illuminate the area?

- A. I had my flashlight, and I have a second one that I carry in my car, and I carry a third one on me. About this time, my second flashlight was starting to go out.
 - Q. So you were going on your third flashlight?
 - A. This won't last very long.
- Q. Did you notice anything of significance out there at the trailhead at Glenshandra?
- A. On my first visit over there, I just noticed there was tire prints, and then back over here there was some old dried mud from -- I don't know how long ago it was -- but there was tire tracks in it. There was hoof prints over here, but this was from a while ago. It was all dried up. As I approached the gate down in here, it was real loose, like light dirt. The kind if you walk into it, it poofs up in your feet. I noticed a couple of footprints on this side over here.
 - Q. When you say "this side," which side?
- A. It would be the east side of the gate, the other side of the gate. Also a bicycle track here. I noticed other vehicle prints, and you could see them down here in this area. That is pretty much it.
- Q. Did you notice any horse hoof prints in proximity to the gate?
- A. The horse hoof prints were back in the area over here.

1 0. Did you see any up by the trailhead gate? 2 Not that I recall, no, sir. Α. 3 Q. But you did see tire tracks up by the gate? 4 I saw a bicycle tire track here. Α. 5 Q. Right. 6 You could see little tire tracks back in this 7 You can see them down in here. Back here. 8 difficult to get a vehicle back in this area. It is really 9 narrow. So larger vehicles couldn't go in there. So the 10 most normal route, if you were going to turn around or pull 11 in, would be this area here. That is where I saw the high 12 majority of tire tracks like this there. 13 Q. And the footprints that you observed, where were 14 those located? They were on the east side, the other side of this 15 Α. 16 gate here. 17 Q. Do you recall how many you saw? 18 Α. Two. 19 Could you tell -- how would you describe those 20 footprints, in terms of the type of shoe that it looked might 21 have made them? 22 MR. SEARS: Your Honor, could we have more 23 foundation as to location. 24 THE COURT: Overruled. You may proceed. 25 THE WITNESS: Some sort of athletic shoe or

1 tennis shoe. Something like that. 2 BY MR. BUTNER: 3 They weren't just flat and plain, so to speak? Q. 4 They weren't like cowboy boots. The weren't the Α. 5 pattern or something like the boots I am wearing. No. They 6 appeared to be some sort of athletic shoe, something like 7 that. 8 The tire tracks, were you able to discern any kind 9 of pattern with the tire tracks there in the dark, so to 10 speak? 11 I just knew they resembled something like a 12 mountain bike. Not as thin as a road racing bike, where the 13 tires are an inch or so wide. This is wider, maybe two inches or more. I don't know, but it appeared to be that 14 wide. 15 16 You ride mountain bikes? Q. 17 Α. Yes, I do. 18 0. So you were kind of familiar with that? Yes, sir. 19 Α. 20 When you observed those footprints and tire tracks Q. 21 there by the trailhead gate, what did you do? 22 The first time when I was here, I didn't think Α. 23 anything of it. I am looking around, and I just see it. 24 Okay, I take a mental note of it. Looking in the area. 25 Looking back here as far as I can see. My flashlight is

really not doing me justice at this point. So it is really 1 2 hard to see anything beyond a couple of feet back here. 3 don't see anything. 4 I basically walk out of the area, still 5 walking back. I meet a couple of other deputies that come over and join me in the canvassing of the neighborhood. 6 7 meet up. Nobody finds anything. Everybody tells me, no, we 8 didn't find anything, Sergeant Acton. We decide to go back 9 and return back to the scene. 10 Q. Speaking of the trailhead area, did you notice any 11 trash in the trailhead area? 12 Not that I recall, no, sir. Α. 13 Q. After you met back up with all of those deputies, 14 where did you go? 15 We returned back to the scene. Α. 16 Q. Back to the Bridle Path address? 17 Α. That's correct. We went back to Bridle Path. 18 At that point what did you do? Q. 19 I saw Sergeant Huante at the scene. Α. 20 Did you report your findings at the Glenshandra 0. 21 trailhead to Sergeant Huante? 22 Α. Yes, I did. 23 And at that point in time, was any -- was a Q. 24 decision made concerning what should be done with your

findings at the Glenshandra trailhead?

1 Α. He told me to go back to the scene --2 MR. SEARS: Hearsay. 3 THE COURT: Overruled. 4 THE WITNESS: He told me to go back to the 5 scene and have it photographed. BY MR. BUTNER: 6 7 Did you return to the Glenshandra trailhead? 0. 8 Deputy Taintor and I returned to that location. Α. 9 What did you do when you got there? 0. 10 When we got there, Deputy Taintor took his camera, Α. 11 and he proceeded to start photographing this area here. 12 also went to the east side of the fence and started 13 photographing whatever trails, footprints, bicycle prints you 14 could see in the dark. 15 I stayed on this side over here and 16 started putting up crime scene tape. Started on the south 17 side here by the residence, and marked off this whole end 18 around here. 19 Did you ever get a look at Deputy Taintor's 0. 20 photographs? 21 They are quite horrific. Α. 22 Q. Not too good; right? 23 Α. And he has the better camera than I do. 24 Q. So this is what you get in the dark out there with flashlights that are dying; right? 25

1	A. Yes.
2	Q. Thank you, very much. You can resume the stand.
3	After taking these photographs out there
4	at the Glenshandra trailhead and putting up all of this crime
5	scene tape, what did you and Deputy Taintor do?
6	A. After that, we left. Deputy Taintor had an
7	assignment to go somewhere else, and I eventually went home.
8	Q. Was anybody detailed, so to speak, to keep an eye
9	on the Glenshandra trailhead?
10	A. I don't recall.
11	Q. That wasn't your area, and you were headed off
12	duty at that point?
13	A. Yes, sir.
14	Q. Who took over the investigation at that juncture?
15	A. Criminal investigations.
16	Q. The CI guys; right?
17	A. Yes, sir.
18	Q. The detectives.
19	Have you had any further involvement with
20	the investigation of Carol Kennedy's murder since that time
21	on July 2nd of 2008?
22	A. No, sir.
23	MR. BUTNER: I don't believe I have any
24	further questions at this point. Thank you.
25	MR. SEARS: Your Honor, I think we have a

1	stipulation on five additional exhibits, and they are 2337,
2	2338.
3	THE COURT: Those are in already.
4	MR. SEARS: 2339, 2340 and 2341, Your Honor.
5	MR. BUTNER: No objection to any of those
6	being admitted at this time, Judge.
7	MR. SEARS: I think you were right. I think
8	37 and 38 were admitted previously.
9	THE COURT: 2339, just to be clear, 2340 and
10	2341 are admitted, ladies and gentlemen.
11	MR. SEARS: Thank you, Your Honor.
12	CROSS-EXAMINATION
13	BY MR. SEARS:
14	Q. Good morning, Sergeant.
15	A. Good morning.
16	Q. Let me show you Exhibit 2319 in evidence. Here.
17	Do you recognize that as a view of 7485
18	Bridle Path taken from Bridle Path looking more or less east?
19	A. Yes, sir.
20	Q. We can see the crime scene tape there. We can see
21	this low stucco wall, or portion of it, that you talked about
22	with Mr. Butner there. The structure directly to the right
23	there, that is the guesthouse; isn't it?
24	A. Right here, sir.
25	Q. And there is an archway that we talked about that

you go through, and you can go left or right, and that is 1 2 where you and the entry team went through; correct? 3 Α. Yes, sir. 4 MR. BUTNER: Mr. Sears, would you tell us the 5 exhibit number, please. 6 MR. SEARS: 2319. 7 MR. BUTNER: Thank you. 8 BY MR. SEARS: 9 And there is also a dirt driveway starting in the 10 lower left of this exhibit that goes up, and it is more or 11 less a circular driveway, goes up towards the guesthouse and 12 loops around over in front of the main house and returns to 13 that opening in that stucco wall; correct? 14 Α. Yes, sir. 15 This is 2316. Now we are looking just a little 16 bit to the north on the lower left-hand corner, that is the other side of that low stucco wall that makes the opening 17 18 that we saw in the previous photo; correct? 19 Α. Yes. 20 You can now actually see more of the circular 21 driveway that goes around those two trees; correct? 22 Yes, sir. Right here. Α. 23 You can't see much of it, but peaking out between the two trees is the front door of the main house; correct? 24 25 Α. I guess so, yes.

1	Q. Off to the left of this photograph, not terribly
2	clear, is the garage, and there is actually a driveway that
3	goes up to the garage that is associated with the main house;
4	correct?
5	A. Yes.
6	Q. Let me show you 2318.
7	This now is looking you can see both
8	sides of the opening in that stucco wall, another view of the
9	guesthouse. Off to the right are some automobiles; correct?
10	A. I don't recall.
11	Q. Can you see on that picture, do those look like
12	automobiles to you? I know you are awfully close.
13	A. Actually, I can't tell.
14	Q. You can't tell what those are yet?
15	A. No.
16	Q. Do you see a pole sticking up?
17	A. Are we talking this, sir?
18	Q. Right. If you go straight down, do you know what
19	those objects are there?
20	A. No, sir. I can't tell.
21	Q. Okay. We have some other photographs of that.
22	That is the guesthouse again in front of us; correct?
23	A. Yes, sir.
24	Q. Those are automobile tire impressions that we can

see in the dirt driveway; right?

- 1 Α. Vehicle impressions, right. 2 We can see them going towards the guesthouse, and Q. 3 we can see some in the lower right-hand corner; correct? 4 Down here, yes, sir. 5 Here is 2317, a little bit closer up, and we can Q. 6 see there appear to be several sets of automobile tire 7 impressions, some going straight towards the archway and some curving off to the left; correct? 8 9 Α. Yes, sir. Can you tell me -- let's go back and look at the 10 11 larger shot. Let's look at 2319 here again. 12 When you arrived on scene, where was 13 Deputy Taintor's patrol vehicle parked? Would it have been 14 somewhere in this picture? 15 To the best of my recollection, it would be right Α. 16 about this area here. 17 Q. He pulled through this little opening and up onto the property, assuming that little wall is a boundary for the 18 19 west side of the property; correct? 20 Α. Yes. 21 Where did you park? Q.
 - A. I am not in this picture. I am back on the road.
 - Q. So you didn't drive up on the property?
 - A. No, sir.

22

23

24

25

Q. During the time you were there, other than Deputy

Taintor's vehicle, did you see any other law enforcement 1 2 vehicles were parked inside the property? 3 No, sir. Α. Mr. Knapp, apparently, tried to pull into that 4 5 opening until you stopped him and backed him up; right? That's correct. 6 Α. 7 Looking again at 2317, do you know whose tire 8 impressions those are? 9 Α. No, I do not, sir. Did you see tire impressions in that general area 10 Q. 11 on the night of July 2nd? 12 Α. I don't recall any, sir. 13 Q. Were you looking for them? 14 Α. No, sir. 15 Were any police officers, to your knowledge, Q. looking at automobile tire impressions in this general area 16 17 in the driveway area on Bridle Path? 18 Α. No. 19 Let's take a little pull back here. Let's see how 20 this looks. Let me try and orient you. This will make a 21 little more sense here. This is Exhibit 2339 in evidence. 22 And do you recognize that, generally, as 23 coming from the bottom of this photo up to the top as Bridle Path and then that 90-degree turn we talked about? 24 Jockey Path, here. 25 Α.

1	Q.	Can you show with your laser pointer the main
2	house and	guesthouse at Bridle Path?
3	Α.	Here's the entrance to the driveway, guesthouse,
4	main house	•
5	Q.	Now, you told us before you went to canvass the
6	neighborho	od and that you had some contact with people named
7	Drake; rig	ht?
8	Α.	Yes, sir.
9	Q.	Can you show us where the Drake house is on that?
10	Α.	It is right over here.
11	Q.	It the house directly south, if we assume this is
12	running no	rth-south, directly south of the Bridle Path
13	residence?	
14	Α.	Yes.
15	Q.	Between the Drake house and the main house is the
16	guesthouse	; right?
17	Α.	Guesthouse, right here.
18	Q.	Let's take a look at Exhibit 2340 here, and
19	probably e	asier if we do it this way. Okay.
20		We can see in yellow there, North
21	Williamson	Valley Road; correct?
22	Α.	Yes, sir. Right here.
23	Q.	Can you see Bridle Path there?
24	Α.	I see Bridle Path here.

Q. Can you stop right about where the 7485 crime

1 scene is. Can you see where that would be in that diagram? 2 Right in there. Α. 3 Right in there, and there is that 90-degree turn; Q. 4 correct? 5 Yes, sir. Α. This shows some of the street names that are 6 Q. 7 associated with the roads around Bridle Path that you could 8 use to get off and on Williamson Valley Road; correct? 9 Α. Yes. 10 And if you were going the drive -- on this map, if 11 you were trying to drive back to Prescott, you would be 12 heading up off the upper right-hand corner; right? 13 You go this way. 14 Down Bridle Path, go that way, or just stay on 15 Bridle Path; right? 16 Yeah, and you can go all the way down here. 17 Q. There is a stop sign there at North Bridle Path 18 and Williamson Valley Road; right? 19 Α. Yeah. 20 If you were coming that way, you would turn left 21 and head south on Williamson Valley Road back towards town; 22 right? 23 You could, yes, sir. Α. 24 It might be easier to see on this Exhibit 2341.

The lettering is a little bit small here.

1 You see Williamson Valley Road in yellow 2 again; right? 3 That would be this area here. 4 Right. And you can see -- let me move it up a 5 little bit. Do you see Glenshandra? Let me put my big old finger there. Do you see Glenshandra? You can't see it at 6 7 all? 8 Is that it? Α. 9 That's it. Q. 10 Α. I can't read it. 11 Take my word for it. You see Glenshandra. Can Q. 12 you see Bridle Path and Jockey Trail, where that intersection 13 is? 14 Α. Is that Bridle Path? 15 And you can see that Williamson Valley Road 16 heads on off the bottom of this Google map back towards town; 17 right? 18 Α. Yes, sir. 19 There is a Sheriff's substation -- there wasn't in 20 July of 2008 -- north of this location? 21 Α. Correct. Up here. 22 If you go up Williamson Valley Road a few more Q. 23 miles east on the Outer Loop Road, it is right there? 24 Α. Right at the intersection. 25 Q. Is that where you were that night?

1	A. No, sir.
2	Q. Were you at 255 East Gurley?
3	A. No, sir.
4	Q. Were you out on patrol?
5	A. I was out on patrol.
6	Q. You can have a seat. Sorry, one more. This is
7	2299. We talked about this a little bit.
8	This is the end of Glenshandra.
9	THE COURT: What is the number?
10	MR. SEARS: 2299.
11	Q. I can see what looks to be automobile tire
12	impressions at the bottom of this exhibit; is that right?
13	A. Right here, yes, sir.
14	Q. Did you see automobile tire impressions that
15	night, July 2nd, 2008?
16	A. Yes, sir.
17	Q. Did you see them in any other locations, other
18	than where they are depicted in 2299?
19	A. I saw them in this general area right through
20	here.
21	Q. It is obvious that automobiles had traveled in
22	that area to you; is that right?
23	A. Yes, sir.
24	Q. Tell me what you did to preserve and inspect those
25	automobile tire impressions that night?

1 Α. I didn't do anything. 2 Nothing? Q. 3 No, sir. Α. 4 Now, you said there were some shoe print 5 impressions and what appear to be bicycle tire impressions, 6 and they were on the far side of that gate; is that right? 7 They were right here on the other side of the gate 8 on the east side. 9 On the inside, on the east side, the open land Q. 10 side? 11 Yes, on Wells Ranch. Α. 12 Did you see any bicycle tire impressions on the Q. 13 near side of that gate, which would be the west side? 14 Α. I could see some faint bicycle tracks that went 15 from the light poofy dirt into this gravel area coming in 16 here. I had to lay my flashlight on the ground and roll it 17 around and try to pick up the prints. It is coming towards 18 the pavement. 19 Who photographed those? 0. 20 Deputy Taintor tried his best to photograph them. 21 I don't know. 22 Did you point those out to any other law Q. 23 enforcement officer besides Deputy Taintor? 24 Α. No, I did not.

You said you saw two shoe print impressions on the

25

Q.

other side that looked like athletic shoe impressions; is 1 2 that right? 3 Α. Yes, sir. Did you see similar shoe impressions on the near 4 5 side, the east side of the gate there -- sorry, on the west 6 side of the gate? 7 On the west side over in this area? Not that I 8 can recall, no. 9 You saw faint bicycle tire impressions. Can you Q. say here today under oath that the faint bicycle tire 10 impressions you saw heading towards that gate was associated 11 12 with the tire impression you saw on the other side of the 13 gate? 14 Α. It matched up to it, the best I tell that night, 15 yes, sir. 16 There are no pictures? 0. 17 The pictures are what Deputy Taintor took. 18 Was there any effort made to keep people from 0. walking over to the bicycle tire impressions --19 The jury is having 20 MR. BUTNER: Excuse me. 21 trouble hearing the witness. If you could move that 22 microphone closer, please, Sergeant Acton. Thank you. 23 THE COURT: Thank you. 24 BY MR. SEARS:

Did you do anything to try and protect or preserve

25

0.

1	these fa	int tire impressions that you say you saw on this
2	side of	the gate?
3	А.	Besides photographing them, we taped off the area,
4	sir.	
5	Q.	As you see it here. You taped the perimeter;
6	right?	
7	Α.	That's correct.
8	Q.	But you were there when law enforcement personnel
9	were wal	king around inside that taped perimeter; correct?
10	А.	I was there twice. I was there previous when I
11	first di	scovered it, and I came back about 10 or 15 minutes
12	later, a	nd we photographed it.
13	Q.	You said you got some extra help, and you did a
14	little c	anvassing of the neighborhood?
15	А.	That's correct.
16	Q.	Who came over and helped you?
17	Α.	That would be Deputy Joy, and I think it was
18	Sergeant	Howard was there, but I don't believe they were down
19	at the e	nd of that road with me and Deputy Taintor.
20	Q.	And then you left and never went back to that
21	area?	
22	Α.	That's correct. I left somewhere around
23	two-some	thing in the morning.
24	Q.	Let's talk about your visit inside the house. You
25	said to	Mr. Butner that there weren't any lights on that you

recall inside the house, but eventually when you were done clearing the scene, you turned on some lights in the hallway that we have seen; correct?

- A. I turned on a light in the hallway, yes, sir.
- Q. So that you could see what you were doing.

I assume that your first priority as you were clearing the scene was just that, that you wanted to see if there was anybody in there, and you wanted to protect all the officers that were inside, if anybody happened to be hiding in the house.

A. That's correct.

- Q. After you cleared the house and determined there was nobody there, then it sounds like you began an initial investigation of the scene involving the body in the room; correct?
 - A. I did not.
- Q. You told us that you went inside and checked for signs of life. That would be part of an investigation; wouldn't it?
- A. I don't consider it part of investigation. I think it is part of my procedure that I check to make sure if the person needs medical care or not.
- Q. Let's call it procedure then. The procedure that you initiated also involved having Deputy Joy go in the room to clear that room; correct?

1 Α. Yes, and I stepped in with him, yes. 2 Q. Also, Deputy Joy was handed a camera to take some 3 photographs inside the room, some of which we have seen here 4 today; correct? 5 Α. Yes. 6 And you said that you detected what you thought Q. 7 was some blood on a light switch on the opposite side of the 8 hallway from the room where the body was found; correct? 9 That's correct. Α. 10 You are still not investigating? 0. I don't consider it an investigation. 11 Α. Okay. And eventually you made some calls and had 12 Q. 13 other law enforcement respond; had your superior, eventually 14 detectives were called, crime scene people were called, a 15 full scale investigation was eventually connected? 16 Yes, sir. I just secured the scene and turned it 17 over to them. You are not trained as a crime scene evidence 18 Q. technician, I assume? 19 20 Α. I am not, sir. 21 Other people have that skill, apparently? Q. 22 Yes, sir. Α. 23 Did it occur to you -- and let's sort of back up Q. 24 The evidence that we heard so far from Deputy Taintor

is that he conducted a survey at the request of another

superior officer to see what the condition of the various
doors to the outside were. Do you remember when he did that?

- A. That would be after we cleared the residence and probably secured the scene. We did a protective sweep of the outside of the residence and the property, and they reported back to me that they had cleared that. They didn't find anything else out there. And I probably told him to make sure to check the status of doors, just to look.
- Q. And his report was that there were two doors that were open. The door that you all went through, the glass doors that went into the dining room area, and then a door on the opposite side of the house that we saw in some pictures that went out towards the garage. Those doors to his recollection were unlocked.

Is that your recollection, as well?

- A. I don't recall, sir. I did not check the doors. The only one I knew that was unlocked for sure was the one I entered on the south side, the glass door.
- Q. Were you there when Deputy Joy walked across the room where the body was and determined that the door from that room to the outside was locked?
 - A. I was not, sir.
- Q. Did you ever see that door in an unlocked condition that night?
 - A. The only time I have seen it unlocked is in this

picture that I was shown earlier today.

- Q. That picture was taken long after you cleared the scene?
 - A. Yes, sir.

- Q. When you were there, that door -- "that door" being the door outside from that room -- was closed; right?
 - A. It was shut.
 - Q. You don't know whether it was locked?
 - A. I have no idea.
- Q. Let's assume for a minute that it was locked.

 That is what Deputy Taintor said. Let's assume that it was locked.

Now you have all of these different doors that go to the outside and two appear to be unlocked, according to Taintor, the door you went in and the door on the opposite side of the house. Did it occur to you that night that the person who did this, or persons who did this, may not have come through the door that goes into the room where the body was? They may have come through one of the other two unlocked doors? Did that occur to you that night?

- A. I don't recall, sir.
- Q. You said that you were -- you turned the light on in the hallway so you could see what you were doing. After you made the protective sweep and determined that you all were likely to be safe and there was no one else around, did

you start thinking that you ought to be careful about where
you and the other deputies and sergeants were walking in that
hallway?

A. That is a consideration in every scene that I go

- A. That is a consideration in every scene that I go into. First is officer safety and then scene preservation, yes, sir.
- Q. Did it occur to you, particularly in that hallway that led from the kitchen, living room, dining room area down to the bedrooms, including the bedroom where the body was found, did it occur to you that might be a place where whoever did this might have walked up and down that hallway?
 - A. Yes, sir.

- Q. Did it also occur to you that because of the amount of blood in the scene, that whoever did that might have tracked even microscopic amounts of blood out into that hallway?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. If you went out that hallway -- if you continued going out that hallway, that hallway would take you to the door on the north side of the house that Deputy Taintor said he found to be unlocked; isn't that right?
 - A. I don't recall that.
- Q. Let's take a look at the diagram. Can we have the ELMO back up, please. Exhibit 631.

Do you recognize this, Sergeant, as a

diagram of the floor plan? I know the writing is difficult 2 to see. The floor plan of the interior of the main house at 3 7485. If you want to come further back towards the ELMO, it might be easier to see. 4 5 Α. Okay. 6 Is that what you recognize it to be? 7 Α. Yes, sir. 8 With your laser pointer, can you point to the room 9 where the body was? 10 Α. This is the end of the hallway there. 11 This is the plastic container. This is the Q. 12 ladder. 13 Α. This is the room here. This is the wall. 14 Stay in that room there for a minute, if you will. 15 Α. Okay. 16 To the right-hand side on the north wall, there is 17 a door; correct? That is a door to the outside; correct? 18 Α. Yes, sir. 19 The opening on the bottom of that picture is a 20 window; isn't it, on the east side? 21 I don't recall, but if you are saying it is a Α. 22 window, okay. 23 There are not two doors to that room that you Q. 24 recall; are there?

Not that I recall. I just recall seeing this

25

Α.

1 here. 2 Q. Let's assume that that door is locked. Are you 3 with me? This one here? 4 Α. 5 Yes, ma'am. Q. 6 Α. Okay. 7 Let's go up. See the hallway there. Proceed up Q. 8 the hallway back towards the kitchen, and you take a right 9 there, instead of going left in the kitchen, there is another 10 door; correct? 11 Α. There is a door here. 12 Did you ever go and look at that door? No, sir. I have made it to here. Looked in here 13 Α. 14 for a person, and proceeded down the hallway. If I told you that that door -- that Deputy 15 0. 16 Taintor found that door to be unlocked, would you have any reason to dispute him? 17 Any reason to dispute him? No. If that is what 18 Α. 19 he reported, that is what he reported. 20 He is an experienced and trained deputy? Q. 21 He took notes, I'm sure. Α. 22 Let's assume that the perpetrator came into the Q. 23 house through one of the two unlocked doors, which would be a 24 reasonable assumption; correct?

25

Α.

It could be, yes.

And we know there is one door -- can you show us 1 0. 2 again the door that you came through. 3 Α. This one here. 4 That comes in on the south side. And there is 0. 5 this unlocked door on the north side; correct? 6 There is a door here. Α. 7 If the perpetrator came through that door, they 8 may well have gone out that door; correct? 9 Α. They could. 10 And to get from the inside of the house, from the 11 room where the murder took place, you would have to go up and down that hallway; wouldn't you? 12 13 Α. Unless you went out. 14 0. Unless you went outside; correct? 15 Α. Yes. 16 Did you look at the door to the outside to see how Q. 17 it would be locked? Could it be locked by a person without a 18 key? 19 I did not look at the door, and I don't recall. Α. 20 You don't remember anything about the locking Q. 21 mechanism? 22 Α. Absolutely not. 23 0. But let's assume, again, that that door is locked 24 and the person didn't go in and out of it, they would go up 25 and down that hallway; correct?

A. They could, yes.

- Q. My question is: Tell me what precautions, if any, you took for yourself and the other people under your command at that moment to not disturb physical evidence on that tile floor up and down that hallway?
- A. As best we could, if we saw anything, we would avoid stepping on it, or to do any cross-contamination. If there was something there that I saw, we photographed it immediately to show how the scene was while we were there and prior to us leaving.
 - Q. You didn't wear crime scene booties, I assume?
 - A. No, sir. I don't have those.
- Q. Of the initial responders, the five of you, none of you had crime scene booties on that night; is that right?
 - A. That would be correct.
- Q. You understand from your training and experience, that blood is not always easily visible to the naked eye.

 Blood can be in very fine spray or very small droplets;

 correct?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Did you do anything to completely stay out of that hallway? For example, did you find another way to move around inside the house without going up and down that hallway?
 - A. No, sir, not through our protective sweep. There

1 was no other way. 2 Did you instruct the people that were under your Q. 3 command that night to not touch light switches, door knobs, 4 objects in the room? 5 Α. They are told not to touch, not to move, and 6 they know that also through training, but they are told that. 7 Did you tell them again? 0. 8 Yes, I did. Α. 9 And did they follow your instructions, as far as Q. 10 you know? 11 Α. Yes, they do. 12 0. Just a question or two more, Sergeant. 13 The pictures that we saw on the screen 14 here, there were a number of pictures of the interior of the 15 room where the body was located that showed a ladder that was 16 over against the door and some large bookshelves that had 17 fallen over; correct? 18 Α. Yes, sir. 19 In your experience, this looked like a pretty 20 violent death for this poor lady; right? Lot of blood and 21 obvious head trauma; correct?

Q. When you see things in a room that are knocked over, out of place, ladders and bookshelves, that calls in your mind for the possibility that there was a violent

Yes, sir.

Α.

struggle in that room before this woman was killed; correct? 1 2 I have no idea, sir. Α. 3 Never crossed your mind that things would be 4 knocked over in a death struggle between Ms. Kennedy and 5 whoever it was that killed her? 6 I have no idea what occurred, sir. 7 I know you don't know what occurred. I am just 8 asking whether you had an opinion, because you said you had 9 other opinions about what the scene represented to you. 10 Did you have an opinion that this looked 11 like a room where a struggle had taken place? 12 MR. BUTNER: Objection. Foundation. 13 THE COURT: Sustained. 14 BY MR. SEARS: 15 0. Did you see signs of a struggle? 16 To the best of my recollection, I just saw the 17 signs of trauma and a diseased person. 18 The bookshelves had been knocked into each other Q. 19 forcefully enough, apparently, so that the top of one of the 20 bookshelves had been ripped off. Did you see that? 21 shelf had been ripped off? 22 I recall something in the pictures. 23 And the bookshelf that it fell into had been Q. 24 knocked backwards with enough force to cut a little gouge into the drywall where the corner of that bookshelf was 25

1	resting.	Did you see that?
2	Α.	I know that the bookshelf was knocked back. I
3	don't reca	ll a gouge.
4		MR. SEARS: I don't have any other questions.
5		Thank you, Your Honor.
6		THE COURT: Redirect.
7		REDIRECT EXAMINATION
8	BY MR. BUT	NER:
9	Q.	Let's see if we could okay.
10		North would be up at the top of this
11	diagram; r	ight?
12	A.	This is north right here.
13	Q.	And, of course, Glenshandra Drive is pictured at
14	the top?	
15	Α.	Glenshandra is right here.
16	Q.	Bridle Path is coming up from the bottom, the
17	south port	ion of this particular diagram?
18	Α.	That's right here, yeah.
19	Q.	Would you show us on the diagram where the Bridle
20	Path resid	ence is located?
21	A.	It is right here.
22	Q.	Now, there's a left-hand turn right in front of
23	the Bridle	Path residence; correct?
24	Α.	Yes.
25	Q.	And does that that is called Jockey Path, I

1 think you said; right? 2 I think so, yes. I am pretty sure. 3 Can you get off of Jockey Path and head out toward 4 Williamson Valley Road? 5 Eventually, if you go down and make a bunch of Α. 6 these lefts and rights through here. This is called Shane, 7 and yes, you can get back on Williamson Valley from here. 8 That is the road that you were talking about. 9 of the other ways out? 10 Α. Yes, sir. And it doesn't look like there is a connection on 11 Q. 12 Jockey Path with North Spur Road? That's correct. 13 Α. 14 0. Is there? 15 Α. There is. 16 Would you show us. You see the gap between Jockey Q. 17 Path and North Spur? 18 Right here. Α. 19 Is that actually a paved road through there? 0. 20 Yes. Α. 21 Q. It is? To the best of my recollection. 22 Α. 23 So that road actually goes all the way through and Q. 24 connects with North Spur Road? 25 Α. Yes. You go through here.

1	Q. And you also indicated that you can go in from
2	Single Tree, which is right down there?
3	A. Right here.
4	Q. And you can go straight up Bridle Path from there?
5	A. Over there.
6	Q. Is that correct?
7	A. Yes, sir.
8	Q. Are there any other roads in there that are not
9	depicted on this particular diagram?
10	A. Yeah, it appears so.
11	Q. Do you remember?
12	A. I don't recall what the names are on here, no,
13	sir.
14	Q. But Shane Road is the one that you pointed out to
15	us that doesn't have a name on it in this diagram also?
16	A. Shane, and I think this is Stable Lane. I am not
17	positive though. I think that is Stable Lane.
18	Q. Okay. All right. Thank you.
19	Just to clarify the record, this is we
20	have been referring to Exhibit No. 2340, this particular
21	diagram. Is that correct, Deputy?
22	A. Yes, sir.
23	Q. When you are traveling on Williamson Valley Road
24	coming from Prescott, you indicated earlier that there was a
25	stop sign at North Bridle Path; is that correct?

A. There would be one down here, if you had to come out and pull onto Williamson Valley.

- Q. And that intersection, when you pull out onto Williamson Valley, is that intersection located just beneath the crest of a hill coming from Prescott?
 - A. To the best of my recollection, it is.
- Q. So if you are concerned about safety, is there a better way to get onto Williamson Valley Road if you are exiting the Bridle Path area?
- A. This is a nice wide open area to come in on Single Tree. It is also a little bit shorter coming this way. Just coming across, it is all residential through here, like 25 mile an hour. This is the way I usually go in, unless there is some reason to go down here, if I have to go on a particular call, and I don't like this way either, because it is a really bad dirt road.
- Q. Up on Glenshandra Drive, that is a residential area, also; correct?
 - A. This is all residential here.
- Q. The area adjacent to the trailhead, are there houses located in that area?
- A. If this is the end down here, there is a residence right here, and residences back here. There is residences all along the road.
 - Q. There is residences all adjacent to the trailhead?

1 Α. Basically the northwest corner over here. 2 Q. And on the photograph here, where would that 3 residence be located? 4 Back over in this area here. 5 There are private drives on those residences from 6 Glenshandra that come out onto Glenshandra? 7 Α. Yeah. 8 Okay. On the -- we are here now with Exhibit No. 9 2299. Correct? 10 Α. Yes. 11 That is a depiction of the Glenshandra trailhead? Q. 12 Yes, it is. Α. 13 And you were talking about finding some -- or Q. 14 seeing some faint tracks in the dusty dirt, so to speak, on the west side of the Glenshandra trailhead? 15 16 Over here. Α. 17 Could you tell what kind of tracks those were? 18 Α. It appeared to be the same track that I saw over 19 here. It is the continuation coming this way of a bicycle 20 track. Okay. Were they as defined prints in that dirt as 21 they were on the east side of the trailhead? 22 23 No, they were not. Α. 24 Would you kind of describe what these faint tracks Q.

25

were like for us, please.

- A. It was really difficult to tell, because you go from the nice poofy dirt, where things can stand out, okay, into this gravel, and you will see it up here closer. It is crushed rock gravel, and where it is a little bit harder to pick up trails coming through here, and that is where it became difficult to see the trail coming through here. Even with my flashlight, laying it down on the ground, I could see a faint trail, but it became very difficult in the crushed rock.
- Q. When you say, "laying it down on the ground," you mean you set your flashlight down on the ground, laying on the ground to see if you could see these tracks?
 - A. Yes, to see it better.
 - Q. At that point in time they were barely visible?
 - A. They were faint, yes, sir.
- Q. Thank you. But you saw that they were more defined on the east side of the trailhead gate?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Those were photographs that you attempted to take, or actually Deputy Taintor did; correct?
 - A. Deputy Taintor, yes, sir.
- Q. Mr. Sears asked you a number of questions about the interior hallway there at Bridle Path. Of course, you went down the hallway when you cleared the scene?
 - A. Yes.

Ι

There were

1 Was that your first time down the hallway? 0. 2 Yes, that was my first time. Α. 3 And after going down the hallway to clear the Q. 4 scene, did you -- what did you do? 5 Α. After I went down the scene -- or the hallway? 6 Or the protective sweep, so to speak; right? 7 I headed back to the kitchen, and that is where I Α. 8 saw the purse. I made identification. I took the I.D., and 9 I walked back there to make positive I.D. of the victim. 10 walked back to the kitchen. I started making phone calls. 11 Deputies came back. I then gave 12 directions on what else they should report to and what they 13 should do. They were sent out to put crime scene tape up. 14 Some people were in charge of keeping the crime scene log. 15 There were two or three of the deputies that took pictures. 16 They were sent out to go take pictures, sent in to take 17 pictures of whatever I was pointing out or whatever they 18 found. 19 The medical people arrived. 20 two that I brought in down the hallway. 21 Everybody had to go in and out of this hallway? Q. 22 It is the only way there. Α. 23 Q.

24

25

When you went down the hallway the first time and then you came back out of the hallway, were you looking for evidence at that point in time?

A. No, I was not.

- Q. After you made these initial couple of trips down the hallway, you had noticed the blood spot on the light switch across the hall; is that correct?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. When was that first noticed?
- A. When I went down there with the I.D., and I was basically looking at the I.D. and I couldn't really tell, so I had to stop and turn. I was looking for the most convenient light to light up besides my flashlight. I stood there and I looked at the light switch, and that is when I noticed the speck of blood there, and I made note of it, and I turned on the light so I could see a little bit better in the area.
- Q. The light that you turned on was that hallway light?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. Were you careful not to touch the blood spatter?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And after doing that and turning on the hallway light, did you ever observe any blood in the hallway?
 - A. Not that I can recall.
- Q. Did you or the other deputies take efforts to avoid disturbing the crime scene?
 - A. Yes, sir. If we see stuff, we try not to disturb

it any more than we already have, and we will take efforts to 1 2 go around it and not step on it and not destroy it. 3 Was there ever any blood discovered in the 4 hallway? 5 Not that I recall. Α. 6 Other than the blood that was located on the light 7 switch; right? 8 Α. That is what I saw, yes. 9 Did you see any other blood in proximity to the Q. 10 crime scene in the bedroom there in the hallway? All I recall is those containers there. 11 Α. That was 12 it. That is all I recall. 13 Q. And all of that was preserved? 14 Α. Yes, sir. 15 0. And photographed? 16 Α. It was photographed. 17 MR. BUTNER: I have no further questions of 18 this witness, Judge. Thank you. 19 THE COURT: There are already a number of jury 20 questions, and I have some more coming I see. 21 What I am going to do, ladies and 22 gentlemen, for your convenience take a break at this point, 23 excuse you from the room, and you can go refresh yourselves, 24 and it may be a little bit longer break because I want to 25 give the staff and the lawyers a little bit of a break.

are going to go over the questions first. 1 2 Remember the admonition. Don't discuss the case among yourselves. 3 4 (Whereupon, the jury exits the courtroom.) 5 THE COURT: The jury has left the room. Do 6 you want to take a break first and then go over the 7 questions? MR. SEARS: I would just as soon look at the 8 9 questions. 10 MR. BUTNER: Just so long as we get a break. THE COURT: I will let the lawyers look at the 11 12 questions and give you a break. 13 (Brief recess.) 14 THE COURT: Let me go on the record, so we can 15 get going with the jury. 16 Mr. Sears and Ms. Chapman are here for 17 the defense. Mr. Butner and Mr. Paupore for the State. 18 We received a number of questions that relate to Sergeant Acton's testimony, and the lawyers have a 19 chance to go over those. Do you have any objection to the 20 21 questions that were posed, Mr. Sears? 22 MR. SEARS: No, Your Honor. I think we 23 decided we can ask them all, even the one about the street 24 connection here, with some appropriate follow-up. 25 THE COURT: I will allow follow-up, as I

1 always do. 2 Mr. Butner, any objections to the 3 questions? 4 MR. BUTNER: No, none. 5 THE COURT: All right. What do you need to do before we get the jury back in, either side? Ready to go? 6 7 MR. BUTNER: I think so. 8 THE COURT: Bring in jury back, please. 9 I am advised we are short one juror 10 still. In particular, I wanted to see how you all wanted to 11 address, since the jury is still not back yet, how you wanted 12 to address the light switch photos. I understand that one of 13 the questions was they wanted to see the original light 14 switch photo, I think in comparison to 2324. There was a 2315. 15 16 MR. SEARS: It is admitted twice. 2324 and 2315 are both admitted. But we have a digital photo on the 17 18 laptop that we can project and they can all see it at once. 19 It is clearer than the individual photos. 20 MR. BUTNER: It may be what they are asking, 21 Judge. I think Mr. Sears pointed it out to me. If they want 22 to look at the photo here, pass it among themselves so they 23 can actually look at the photo, rather than the ELMO version. 24 THE COURT: Can I ask for purposes of clarification, if 2315 and 2324 are actually the same photo, 25

1	but
2	MR. BUTNER: I think they are, yes.
3	MR. SEARS: They were inadvertently marked one
4	by each side this morning.
5	THE COURT: It isn't two photos. It is just
6	one photo.
7	MR. SEARS: If we can have a second here, we
8	can show Mr. Butner what it looks like. It is much quicker
9	than passing around the photo to 17 jurors. I think you will
10	see it is clearer. It is a digital photo.
11	THE COURT: Should we have a stipulation that
12	the photo, even though it is marked twice, is actually the
13	same photo?
14	MR. BUTNER: Sure.
15	MR. SEARS: Yes. 2315 and 2324 are the same
16	image, Your Honor.
17	THE COURT: Okay. If you don't mind me
18	telling them that that is admitted twice, we can do that.
19	Can you zoom in on that? Do you want to
20	show it that way, gentlemen?
21	MR. BUTNER: I think backed out is a little
22	bit better, a better view. That is probably better.
23	THE COURT: Do you want to start with the
24	light switch photo and explain it is admitted twice?
25	MR. SEARS: Start with that, and then at some

point they wanted to see a particular exhibit again.

MR. BUTNER: We have to put the screen up for this. We will do these two things and then put the screen up and show them this.

THE BAILIFF: The harder part is moving the machine without unplugging it.

THE COURT: Bring the jury back in.

(Whereupon, the jury enters the courtroom.)

THE COURT: Mr. Butner, Mr. Sears, please.

(Whereupon, a discussion was held off the record.)

THE COURT: Record reflects the defendant is present. Mr. Sears, Ms. Chapman on his behalf, and Mr. Paupore and Mr. Butner for the State.

I had a large number of questions for this witness. One I received from somebody who apparently composed it overnight. Again, let me caution you about doing any research, but I understand that brains don't stop thinking at nighttime. So I do not prohibit jurors from coming in with questions in the morning, if they typed them out and used the computer simply as a word processing device, as opposed to looking up or doing research. The word processing is permitted, obviously. The research is prohibited.

And I recognize that it is a lengthy question that I am not going to ask in this particular

1 fashion. What I am going to say, as agreed upon by the 2 lawyers that I could, in trials, evidence may come in in bits and pieces. Some through some witnesses, some bits come out, and other bits of information come out through other To an extent, you have to be patient with the witnesses. 6 process in which various witnesses may see things and other 7 witnesses may see other things. 8 So I think, if the lawyers have directed 9 me in the right direction, I am being told that this question 10 will be answered through additional witnesses, through the 11 process of the presentation that Sergeant Acton -- it is probably unfair to ask this question of this particular

3

4

5

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Be patient. There will be other witnesses to address the question. I don't know who this came from, and I don't need to know who this came from, but I think I want to make that comment at this time.

witness in the fashion in which this proposes it.

Anything else on that topic, Mr. Butner or Mr. Sears?

> MR. SEARS: No, Your Honor.

MR. BUTNER: Nothing further from the State, Judge. Thank you.

QUESTIONS BY THE JURY

THE COURT: We did have a number of questions, though, that need responses. There was a question:

look at the original light switch photo?"

In responding to this question I think I learned, and I think the lawyers may have learned as well, that actually the same light switch photo is admitted twice. It is simply a duplicate. You had one No. 2315 that was admitted, I think, yesterday. And we had 2324 that was admitted today. It is actually the same photo simply reproduced twice, and has been marked twice and admitted twice, but it is the same photo. Having had the question: "Can we look at the light switch photo again?" We thought that rather than letting you pass it from one to the other, to be more efficient, to simply put it up on the wall.

Are you prepared to do that at this time?

Let's try this: If you want to see the original, let me know. If there is anybody that still wishes to have the original passed to you, would you raise your hand? I don't see anybody raising their hand. Thank you.

Thank you, Mr. Robertson.

The record should reflect that a slightly enlarged presentation in projection on the wall was made by the parties in response to that question.

Question for Sergeant Acton: Was there any blood on the ladder?

THE WITNESS: Not that I recall.

THE COURT: Were any books under the turned

over bookshelf? 1 2 THE WITNESS: Not that I recall. 3 I think we have another -- let me THE COURT: 4 save the others for -- we have a couple of other exhibit 5 requests, 2330, gentlemen and Ms. Chapman, and 2334. Let me 6 save that, and perhaps you could -- one or the other side 7 could get those exhibits out, 2330 and 2334. 8 Sergeant Acton, how many death 9 investigations have you been involved in? 10 THE WITNESS: Hundreds. 11 THE COURT: Question: What was directly 12 opposite of the ladder? If it had fallen backwards, what 13 could it have possibly been propped up against? 14 THE WITNESS: I don't know how to answer that 15 question, sir. 16 THE COURT: All right. There has been some 17 reference to the ladder laying across the door. Do you mean 18 leaning against something? 19 The ladder was leaning at the THE WITNESS: 20 top edge of the door. It was right on top of the door, that 21 is what it was touching. 22 THE COURT: Ouestion: How was the ladder 23 supposed to be positioned? 24 THE WITNESS: The best I could tell, the rungs 25 at the far end -- if you remember the pictures, all the way

1 at the other end of the room, there was a couple of metal 2 clips that came down, that is where the ladder belonged, down 3 there. THE COURT: Where was the loft in this room? 4 5 THE WITNESS: If you walk in the door, walking 6 in the bedroom from the hallway, turn directly right, look 7 down there, and it is right behind, up on that side. If you are standing in the hallway, look in the room and turn to 8 9 your right, it would be up above, slightly down and up above. 10 THE COURT: Question: Do deputies have radios 11 they carry with them, or are they only in their cars? THE WITNESS: We carry portable radios on us, 12 13 but they don't always work to the best of their ability. 14 THE COURT: Question: Were dogs barking at 15 you while you were in the house with the victim? 16 The dogs that were in the THE WITNESS: No. 17 house, the two, only barked at us as we approached the door. 18 Once we opened the door, the dogs came out and we went in, 19 and after that, they did not bark at us anymore. 20 THE COURT: Question: Were there any marks on 21 the gate where a bike being lifted over might have left a 22 mark, scratch or paint smear? 23 THE WITNESS: I don't recall any marks. 24 THE COURT: Question: Are there streetlights 25 at Bridle Path and Williamson Valley intersection?

1 THE WITNESS: No streetlights. 2 THE COURT: Question: Do you know if other 3 officers walked the complete trail to find more prints? 4 THE WITNESS: I do not know. 5 THE COURT: Question: Do Jockey Path Road and 6 North Spur Road, in fact, actually connect? 7 THE WITNESS: They do connect, but it is down 8 a ways. 9 THE COURT: I have a question about the Ranger 10 pickup driven by Mr. Knapp and what direction it came from? 11 THE WITNESS: The vehicle came from the south 12 on Bridle Path, and was driving north towards the house. 13 Coming from the south and driving north. 14 THE COURT: I have a question: Is it possible 15 to see Exhibit 2330 again? Does somebody have 2330? 16 MR. BUTNER: I have it, Judge, and I will get 17 2334, also. 18 THE COURT: All right. Why don't you set up whatever you need to set up to retrieve that and allow the 19 20 jury to see that. 21 MR. BUTNER: Judge, we have an agreement, 22 Mr. Sears and I do, that this particular photographic map 23 overlooking the area can be made into an exhibit and admitted 24 into evidence, and we have agreed that it can be shown to the

jury at this point in time in response to the question about

1 Spur and the connection. 2 THE COURT: Are you going to give it a particular number, or just the next number? 3 4 MR. SEARS: What we will have to do is, over 5 the recess, we will have to print out an eight-and-a-half by 6 eleven and bring that back to court. 7 THE COURT: Can we save a number for doing 8 that? Is that possible under the current system? 9 Why don't we just go ahead and project it 10 and then we will make a record of what the number is at the time that you bring the physical exhibit in. 11 12 MR. SEARS: This is another portion of 2215, 13 Your Honor. 14 THE COURT: Is somebody going to pose a 15 question at this point? 16 I will. MR. BUTNER: 17 Do you see where Bridle Path is located, Sergeant Acton? You have got that laser pointer; right? 18 THE WITNESS: This is Bridle Path. 19 20 MR. BUTNER: And then the street that turns to the left off of Bridle Path is named? 21 22 THE WITNESS: Jockey Path. 23 MR. BUTNER: And where is -- I think it is 24 called Spur Drive? Is it further south on the next photo?

THE WITNESS: It is down this way.

1 MR. BUTNER: If we raise this, we will lose 2 Why don't we go ahead and raise it, though. Glenshandra. 3 Spur Road it is called; correct? 4 THE WITNESS: I don't know. 5 MR. BUTNER: Okay. Are you now able to see 6 where Spur Road connects with Bridle Path? 7 THE WITNESS: Back over here. There is a 8 trail right here, too. Right there. 9 MR. BUTNER: Is it further south? 10 THE WITNESS: Right there. 11 MR. BUTNER: Oh. Let me show you -- let me 12 get this marked and put this on the overhead. It has got the 13 full picture, because we are not able to see everything. 14 This is Exhibit No. 2340. Needs to go 15 just a little further south. A little further. Little 16 further. There it is. 17 We can't see Bridle Path, then. 18 street that is coming in, that street there is Jockey Path; isn't it, the one that you were just pointing at? 19 20 THE WITNESS: This is Bridle Path right here. 21 Then Jockey Path comes around, and you come down back to the 22 intersection here. Come back down. There is an intersection 23 here. You go back this way; here, here, here, and back 24 out this way.

MR. BUTNER: Where does Spur Road connect with

1	Bridle Path?
2	THE WITNESS: This is it down here. I am not
3	positive, though, but this is I am not sure. I know that
4	is Bridle Path here.
5	MR. BUTNER: Let me put it on the ELMO.
6	That is where Spur Road connects with
7	Bridle Path?
8	THE WITNESS: Right here.
9	MR. BUTNER: And that little part there, how
10	does that connect with is it Jockey Path there?
11	THE WITNESS: That is Jockey Path right here.
12	MR. BUTNER: How does that section of Spur
13	Road connect with Bridle Path?
14	THE WITNESS: There is a little bridgeway
15	there, but other than that, it doesn't.
16	MR. BUTNER: There is a bridgeway that goes
17	across it?
18	THE WITNESS: Yes.
19	MR. BUTNER: Is it for cars?
20	THE WITNESS: No.
21	MR. BUTNER: It is for people?
22	THE WITNESS: People.
23	MR. BUTNER: People and other objects?
24	THE WITNESS: There is like a little gully
25	running through here, like a little wash.

1 MR. BUTNER: Thank you, very much. 2 that addresses the question. 3 Then I have these other photos to show. 4 THE COURT: The lawyers have agreed to do a 5 physical exhibit that will be renumbered. Mr. Butner, the 6 one that you showed that you put up on the ELMO was what? 7 The one that was being projected by computer on the wall has 8 not been given a number yet. We will identify what that 9 number is. The one that Mr. Butner used was? 2340. 10 MR. BUTNER: 11 THE COURT: 2340. Thank you. 12 MR. BUTNER: Thank you, Judge. 13 The jurors asked to see Exhibit No. 2330 14 again. And for the record what is depicted in that exhibit? 15 THE WITNESS: We have the ladder here, the 16 bookshelf here, another bookshelf back here. We have the 17 checkbook here, the computer desk right here, and entryway 18 into the room here. 19 MR. BUTNER: Did you notice anything located 20 on the carpet area by the checkbook? 21 THE WITNESS: Blood stains. And then this 22 part, the little knobs here, that is what holds up the trim 23 along the desk. That is not in the picture, though. 24 MR. BUTNER: And then Exhibit No. 2334.

THE WITNESS: Again, there is the checkbook

1 here. Blood stains. 2 THE COURT: With regard to this 2334, there 3 was a specific question from a juror: Was there a bloody 4 handprint above the checkbook? 5 THE WITNESS: I don't know. 6 THE COURT: Thank you. That concluded the 7 juror questions. If there are anymore, please let us know. 8 I will let the lawyers have follow-up on the questions that 9 were posed. We will start with Mr. Butner. 10 FOLLOW-UP QUESTIONS 11 MR. BUTNER: Were those pictures taken by 12 Deputy Joy, to your knowledge? 13 THE WITNESS: Yes, I believe so. 14 MR. BUTNER: And you had detailed him to do 15 that? 16 THE WITNESS: Yes. The deputies were 17 instructed to take pictures. 18 MR. BUTNER: Okay. I don't have any further 19 questions at this time. Thank you. 20 THE COURT: Mr. Sears. 21 MR. SEARS: Thank you, Your Honor. 22 FOLLOW-UP QUESTIONS 23 MR. SEARS: Sergeant, we are talking about 24 this ladder that was found in the room where the body was 25 found, and you said, if I understood your testimony, that it

1 appeared to you that the ladder was made so that it would 2 hang on some hooks on the wall, so that a person could use 3 that ladder to get up to the loft area. That is what you 4 thought? 5 THE WITNESS: That is what I thought those 6 metal hooks are. 7 MR. SEARS: You certainly don't know on July 8 2nd, 2008, where that ladder had been just before it landed 9 in the position you saw it in? 10 THE WITNESS: I do not know, sir. 11 MR. SEARS: And you don't know whether that 12 ladder was even kept in that room any longer; correct? 13 THE WITNESS: I don't know. MR. SEARS: That ladder wasn't fixed to the 14 wall so that it had to be removed. They are just hooks? 15 THE WITNESS: That is what it appeared to be, 16 17 sir. MR. SEARS: So it could be taken down and 18 19 moved around and kept anywhere? 20 THE WITNESS: Yes. 21 MR. SEARS: You didn't see any evidence that would in any way lead you to some conclusion about where the 22 23 ladder had been before it came to rest on the top of the 24 door? 25 THE WITNESS: No, sir.

MR. SEARS: You didn't see marks on the carpet or marks on the wall that you thought were associated with a ladder? THE WITNESS: Not that I recall. MR. SEARS: Similarly, there was a question from the jury about marks on the gate. I think they were talking about the gate at the end of Glenshandra. Is that what you thought the question was about? THE WITNESS: That is what I thought the question was, sir. MR. SEARS: Did you inspect that gate? THE WITNESS: I looked at it. MR. SEARS: Did you look at it for possible biological or fingerprint evidence? THE WITNESS: I just looked at it, and I didn't see anything standing out in my mind. MR. SEARS: Did you touch the lock? THE WITNESS: No, I did not. MR. SEARS: Did you look to see if the lock was locked? THE WITNESS: I observed that the lock was locked. MR. SEARS: What kind of lock was it? THE WITNESS: It was a padlock. MR. SEARS: Did it require a key or a

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

combination? 1 2 THE WITNESS: A key. 3 MR. SEARS: A key; is that right? THE WITNESS: That is what I recall. 4 5 MR. SEARS: There was a piece of paper in some 6 pictures that we saw that was on the barbed wire fence that 7 Deputy Taintor told us were instructions about how a person 8 could get permission to go through that gate and use the lock 9 by calling a certain number. Do you remember seeing that 10 paper? 11 THE WITNESS: I remember seeing, yes, a white 12 piece of paper that was typed up and a clear plastic thing. 13 MR. SEARS: It was on the fence? 14 THE WITNESS: To the right, yes, on the fence. 15 MR. SEARS: Did you contact the telephone 16 number on that piece of paper? 17 THE WITNESS: No, I did not, sir. 18 MR. SEARS: Did you know whose phone number it is? 19 20 THE WITNESS: No, I do not. 21 MR. SEARS: Apparently, somehow, whoever put 22 that lock on there, would let people go through there with 23 permission? 24 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir. It said that local 25 people could go through.

1 MR. SEARS: Thank you. That is all I have. 2 Thank you, Your Honor. 3 THE COURT: Anything further, Mr. Butner? 4 MR. BUTNER: Nothing further. Thank you, 5 Judge. 6 THE COURT: May Sergeant Acton be excused from 7 further participation in the trial? 8 MR. BUTNER: She may. 9 THE COURT: Any objection? Do you want her 10 subject to recall? 11 MR. SEARS: Please. 12 THE COURT: You are subject to recall, 13 Sergeant Acton. The possibility remains that you could get 14 called back. The lawyers will have to be in touch with you as to the date of that and time of that. So you remain under 15 16 the rule excluding witnesses. You must not discuss your 17 testimony with anyone, except for the lawyers, and then when 18 no other witnesses are present, as I am sure you understand 19 the rule. 20 THE WITNESS: Yes, sir. 21 THE COURT: But you can step down at this 22 point. 23 THE WITNESS: Okay. Thank you. 24 THE COURT: Next witness, Mr. Butner. 25 MR. BUTNER: I call Deputy Scott Joy to the

1 stand. 2 THE CLERK: You do solemnly swear or affirm 3 under the penalty of perjury that the testimony you are about 4 to give will be the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but 5 the truth, so help you God? 6 THE WITNESS: I do. 7 THE COURT: Mr. Butner. 8 MR. BUTNER: Thank you. 9 SCOTT JOY, 10 called as a witness, having been duly sworn, testified as 11 follows: 12 DIRECT EXAMINATION 13 BY MR. BUTNER: 14 0. Please state your name for the record. 15 My name is Scott Joy. Α. 16 And what is your occupation, sir? 17 I am a deputy sheriff with the Yavapai County Sheriff's office. 18 19 And how long have you been a deputy sheriff with 0. 20 the Yavapai County Sheriff's office? 21 I have been there with the Sheriff's office since Α. 22 October of '97, and on patrol since May of '99. 23 Q. So about 13 years all total? 24 Α. Yes, sir.

And have you had any special training or education

25

Q.

1 to prepare yourself for your occupation as a Deputy Yavapai 2 County Sheriff? 3 Α. Yes, I have. 4 What is that, please? Please describe it. 5 It was a 17-week program through the Northern Α. 6 Arizona Regional Training Academy. Ran from January through 7 May of 1999. 8 0. Okay. 9 And since then, I have had numerous in-service Α. 10 POST accredited trainings. 11 Numerous training seminars and things of that Q. 12 nature since then? 13 Α. Yes, sir. 14 Have you basically been a patrol officer since 15 1999 consistently? 16 Α. Yes, I have. 17 And were you performing your duties as a patrol 18 officer, patrol deputy for the Yavapai County Sheriff's 19 office on July the 2nd of the year 2002? 20 THE COURT: Excuse me? 21 MR. BUTNER: 2002? I don't know where that 22 came from. 23 July the 2nd of 2008? Q. 24 Α. Yes, I was, and 2002 also.

25

Q.

Well, thank you.

On July 2nd of 2008, do you recall what shift you were working?

- A. I was working a swing shift from 2:00 to midnight.
- Q. And while you were on that particular shift, did you have occasion to receive information for you to somehow respond to a location on Bridle Path?
 - A. Yes, I did.
- Q. Would you tell us how you got the information for you to respond to Bridle Path?
- A. That night I was working as a field training officer for Deputy Chad Shilling, and being it was his last shift with me for his training phase, we were kind of wrapping things up, and I heard a couple of the sergeants, Sergeant Acton and Sergeant Howard, say that they were going to be responding to an address. It is kind of unusual to have both sergeants state that they were going to be going to the same place at the same time during that frame. So I contacted dispatch and found out that Deputy Taintor had responded to a welfare check.
- Q. And Sergeants Acton and Howard were also responding to that same location?
 - A. Yes, they were.
 - Q. That was unusual?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. Did you hear all of this over the radio?

1 Α. 2 radio. 3 dispatch. 4 0. 5 Α. 6 7 8 9 Q. 10 11 Α. 12 Q. 13 Α. 14 15 16 17 Q. 18 Α. 19 0. 20 Α. 21 Q. 22 Α. 23 24 house.

- A. I heard Sergeant Acton and Sergeant Howard on the radio. The other information I got via cell phone from dispatch.
 - Q. What did you decide to do?
- A. We hadn't had many welfare checks, Deputy Shilling and I, so I thought it would be good for his training to see how to conduct a welfare check. So we got the address and went to the residence.
- Q. Approximately what time did you arrive out at the Bridle Path location?
 - A. It was about a quarter after 9:00 p.m.
 - Q. And what did you observe when you got there?
- A. When I got there, Deputy Taintor was there,
 Sergeant Acton, Deputy Boan, I believe was also there, and
 Sergeant Howard responded there, got there about the same
 time I did.
 - Q. So how many police cars were parked out there?
 - A. Five total.
 - Q. And you and Shilling were in the same vehicle?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. What did you do upon arrival at Bridle Path?
- A. Spoke with Sergeant Acton and Deputy Taintor, and Deputy Taintor advised me of what he had seen inside the
 - Q. What did he indicate to you?

	- 11
1	
2	a
3	s
4	0
5	
6	
7	
8	a
9	a
10	li
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	s
16	
17	t
18	
19	f
20	
21	t
22	
23	0

	Α.	. Не	e said	he	had	gotter	n tl	nere :	for a	welf	are	e ch	ec	k,
and	hac	d gone	around	d cl	necki	ing th	cou	gh the	e wind	lows,	ar	nd h	ad	
seen	a	woman	lying	on	the	floor	in	what	appea	red	to	be	а	pool
of b	loc	od.												

- Q. So upon receiving that information, was some sort of plan formulated?
- A. It was decided we would make entry into the house and clear it and make sure that the woman inside was okay, and see if there was anybody else either in need of help or in the house at all.
 - Q. Who was in charge, basically?
 - A. In charge of?
 - Q. Was somebody supervising the situation?
- A. Sergeant Acton was the acting supervisor for the scene.
- Q. Okay. And what was your role in proceeding with the plan?
- A. My role was as point man. So basically I was the first one to walk into the scene and then into the residence.
- Q. Okay. Do you remember which direction you entered the house from?
- A. We came in through the driveway on the west side of the residence and walked along the south side of the driveway up towards the detached garage.
 - Q. We are getting full cabinets here.

1 Let me show you what is admitted into 2 evidence as Exhibit No. 2320. Let me, as I stated, show you 3 what was marked as Exhibit 2320. 4 Do you recognize what is depicted in that 5 exhibit? Yes, I do. 6 Α. 7 What is it? 0. That would be the French doors on the south side 8 Α. 9 of the residence of Bridle Path. Are those the doors through which you entered? 10 Q. 11 Yes, they are. Α. When you approached the doors, did you notice 12 Q. 13 anything of significance upon your approach? The door was open. There wasn't any blinds, and 14 Α. there were two little dogs in there just barking up a storm. 15 There were a couple of dogs barking at you as you 16 Q. 17 came up to the doors? 18 Yes, sir. Α. Was this -- I think we heard Sergeant Acton say a 19 20 tactical type of maneuver. Was this a tactical maneuver that 21 you were engaging in? 22 Yes, it was. It is called a single stack, where Α. 23 we have one designated point man, and everybody lines up in a 24 single file right behind them to make the approach. 25 Before entering the Bridle Path residence, the 0.

1 main house there, had somebody else gone someplace else? 2 Before that we had stopped on the walkway, and a Α. 3 couple of deputies went in to clear the residence that is part of the detached garage. 4 5 Okay. And that was located further to the south? Q. 6 To the south, yes. 7 Is this another -- Exhibit No. 2252. Is this 8 another exhibit -- is this another photograph of the doors 9 through which you entered? 10 Yes, it is. Α. 11 And the other residence -- or the other area that Q. 12 somebody else inspected, where was that located? 13 It would be to the side of this walkway, 14 practically back behind where the camera was when this 15 picture was taken. And who went and inspected that area? 16 17 Α. I do not know for sure. 18 0. You don't remember? No, sir. I was at the front, and anything else 19 Α. 20 was happening back behind me. 21 0. Were you armed at this time? 22 Α. Yes, I was. 23 How were you armed? Q. 24 Α. I had my department issued AR-15.

25

Q.

So you had a rifle?

1	Α.	Yes, sir.
2	Q.	The other officers, did they have their sidearms
3	drawn?	
4	А.	Yes, they did.
5	Q.	Was it light or dark?
6	Α.	It was dark.
7	Q.	Did you have flashlights?
8	Α.	Yes.
9	Q.	So you entered through these double glass doors
10	here?	
11	Α.	Yes.
12	Q.	And tell us what you did after that.
13	Α.	When I opened the doors, I walked in, and I
14	scanned to	the right into the kitchen area and then on the
15	left where	there was a recessed living room area. As we made
16	our way th	rough the little dining room part of the kitchen,
17	there was a	a hallway that went off to the right, and I held
18	and staged	there at the right, while the other areas were
19	cleared by	the other deputies.
20	Q.	Let me show you what is admitted into evidence as
21	Exhibit 232	22.
22		Do you recognize that?
23	Α.	Yes. That would be the interior of the door, and

then the little dining area with the kitchen being back on

this side of it.

1	Q. Okay. And Exhibit 2321.
2	What is depicted in that?
3	A. That would be the kitchen.
4	Q. And did you proceed past that area?
5	A. Yes, I did.
6	Q. Let me show you what is admitted as Exhibit 2323.
7	Do you recognize what is depicted in that
8	exhibit?
9	A. That would be the pantry that is attached to the
10	breakfast bar in the kitchen, and the other side of that is
11	the hallway.
12	Q. So did you go around that pantry area and proceed
13	down the hallway to the right?
14	A. Yes, I did. I came across on the left side of
15	this, and then hooked to the right to face down the hallway.
16	Q. Were you and the other officers in single file at
17	that time?
18	A. Yes, we were.
19	Q. Describe how you proceeded down the hallway?
20	A. We use a tactical building clearance method, where
21	I as the point man would stay up front. Walk up, approach
22	the door, make sure nothing is coming ahead, and stop on the
23	other side of the door while other deputies would file in
24	there to clear it to make sure nobody was in there.
25	Q. Who was behind you, if you recall?

1	Α.	I don't recall the order, but I know Sergeant
2	Acton, Dep	uty Taintor, Deputy Shilling and Sergeant Howard
3	were in th	ere.
4	Q.	Let me show you what has been admitted into
5	evidence a	s Exhibit 2242.
6		Is that the hallway?
7	Α.	Yes, it is.
8	Q.	And you proceeded down that hallway?
9	Α.	Yes, I did.
10	Q.	As the point person, how do you function in this
11	operation?	What it is that you do?
12	Α.	My function in that is to maintain coverage for
13	any potent	ial threat that could be down at the end of the
14	hall, and	to prevent that threat from advancing on the
15	officers t	hat are clearing the rooms back behind me.
16	Q.	The officers follow you as you proceed down the
17	hall. You	pause at the doorways?
18	Α.	Yes.
19	Q.	And they go into the rooms and clear the rooms?
20	Α.	Yes.
21	Q.	And then you advance down the hall?
22	Α.	Correct.
23	Q.	And at the end of the hall, what did you do?
24	Α.	At the end of the hall where the tubs are, I
25	looked to	the right, saw a bedroom. I looked to the left,

1 and that is where I saw a woman laying on the ground. 2 That is where the victim was located? Q. 3 Α. Correct. 4 What was your responsibility once you had arrived 5 at the end of the hall? 6 Α. My responsibility at that point was to make entry 7 into that room and clear that for anybody else and see if 8 anybody else was inside that needed assistance. 9 Would you describe for us how you made entry into Q. 10 that room. 11 Α. As I went into the room, there was a ladder that 12 was propped up against the wall across the doorway. 13 the door were open, it was almost pinned against the wall, 14 leaving the doorway open. The woman was laying on the ground 15 on the other side of that. So I had to go under the ladder 16 and step over her to be able to get into the room. 17 0. Did you step on any blood when you went in there? Not that I am aware of. 18 Α. 19 Were you trying to avoid doing that? Q. 20 Very much so. Α. 21 After going under this ladder, but over her body, Q. 22 what did you do then once you got inside the room? 23 Α. Once I got inside, I looked and saw there was a

set of closets to the right along the same wall as the door,

and above that there was, I guess, an alcove, a raised area.

24

1 There was some shelves knocked over there. I looked around 2 to see if anybody else was in that area. 3 And so you cleared that area for officer safety at 4 that time? 5 Α. Yes, I did. 6 This area that you called an alcove, is this the Q. 7 elevated area? Is that what you are talking about? 8 Yes, above the closets. Α. 9 A loft type area? Q. 10 Α. Yes. 11 Did you see anybody up in the loft area? Q. 12 Α. I could not see up there. The only way I could be 13 able, I looked up there as best I could, but without climbing 14 on the furniture or up on the ladder, I could not get a full 15 view of the area. 16 To go further, we are going to have to use that. 17 Sorry. Okay. 18 Were you assigned some responsibilities in terms of this scene, in addition to doing this point 19 20 person on the protective sweep? 21 Yes, I was. Α. 22 What were you assigned to do? Q. 23 Α. Since I was already in the room, it was decided that I would photograph the area so nobody else would have to 24

come in there and possibly, you know, mess anything else up,

I guess.	
Q.	Okay. Let me show you what is admitted into
evidence a	s Exhibit No. 2277.
	Is that what you observed when you
went be	fore you went into the room?
Α.	Yes, it is.
Q.	Do you see these do you see these boots
standing u	p here at the top of the picture?
Α.	Yes, I do.
Q.	Do you know who is filling those boots?
Α.	That would be me.
Q.	You are already inside the room taking pictures?
A.	When this picture was taken, Deputy Taintor had a
camera, an	d he handed the camera to me.
Q.	He took the first picture while you had stepped
inside?	
Α.	Yes.
Q.	And then he passed the camera to you?
Α.	Yes.
Q.	And you began taking photos?
Α.	Correct.
Q.	Let me show you what has been admitted into
evidence a	s exhibit let me show you what has been admitted
into evide	ence as Exhibit 2282.
	Q. evidence a went be A. Q. standing u A. Q. A. camera, an Q. inside? A. Q. A. Q. evidence a

Do you recognize that particular

1	photograph	?
2	Α.	Yes, I do.
3	Q.	Is that one of the ones that you took?
4	Α.	Yes, it is.
5		THE COURT: May I see counsel and the exhibit,
6	please. O	kay.
7	BY MR. BUT	NER:
8	Q.	Just clarifying its admission status. Exhibit
9	2282.	
10		You took this particular photo; is that
11	correct?	
12	Α.	Yes, it is.
13	Q.	Is this one of the first ones that you
14	photograph	ed?
15	Α.	Yes.
16	Q.	And let me show you what is admitted into evidence
17	as Exhibit	No. 2283.
18		Do you recognize that photo?
19	Α.	Yes, I do.
20	Q.	Is that one you took also?
21	Α.	Yes, it is.
22	Q.	Let me show you what is admitted into evidence as
23	Exhibit No	. 2327.
24		Do you recognize what is depicted in that
25	photograph	?

1	A. That would be the ladder bracing against the door
2	and the desk, as well as the body on the floor.
3	Q. Okay. Is this the way the scene appeared when you
4	were in there?
5	A. Yes, it is.
6	Q. Except for daylight; right?
7	A. Except for it being daylight.
8	Q. You didn't take this photo; did you?
9	A. No, I did not.
10	Q. Let me show you what is marked as 2328. Do you
11	recognize what is depicted in that particular photograph?
12	A. Yes. That would be another angle of the ladder
13	across the door and the closet.
14	Q. So the ladder was going over the door and holding
15	the door open?
16	A. Correct.
17	Q. Could you see where the ladder had been propped
18	prior to it being in that position?
19	A. Prior to that, no, but it is the only way to
20	access that loft area. So there was a cutout of the railing
21	around there that would allow access from the ladder.
22	Q. Let me show you what has been admitted as Exhibit
23	2332.
24	Is that the loft area you were talking
25	about?

1 Yes, it is. Α. 2 And where is the area that you are talking about Q. 3 where you access the loft area with the ladder? 4 All the way to the left. Α. 5 In this particular area right here? 6 Yes, sir. Where it is kind of framed in above 7 there. 8 Were there actually some sorts of clips or notches Q. 9 or something for the ladder to attach to? 10 I believe so, yes. Α. 11 Q. This was the area that you were concerned about 12 clearing when you came in? 13 Α. Yes. 14 And are these the clips or notches that you were 15 talking about that the ladder would attach to? 16 Yes, sir. Α. Was there anything over on this side of the room 17 Q. 18 for the ladder to be attached to or be used for? 19 Α. No, sir. 20 What is this down here that I am pointing to? 21 you remember what that is? 22 It looks as if you are pointing at the window. Α. 23 Q. Right. Was there a window on that wall in the 24 room? 25 Α. Yes, sir.

1	Q. Is that the window through which Deputy Taintor
2	observed the body, to your knowledge?
3	A. To my knowledge, yes.
4	Q. Let me show you what has been admitted into
5	evidence as Exhibit 2331.
6	What is depicted in that particular
7	A. That would be one of the overturned bookshelves.
8	Q. Is that the way it appeared when you entered that
9	scene?
10	A. Yes, it is.
11	Q. And then let me show what you is admitted into
12	evidence as Exhibit 2333.
13	What is depicted in that exhibit?
14	A. That would be another one of the bookshelves, and
15	it is in the corner there along by the window that Deputy
16	Taintor had looked through.
17	Q. Is this the way that the scene appeared when you
18	entered that room?
19	A. Yes, it is.
20	Q. Approximately what time did you enter the room
21	that day in July 2nd of 2008?
22	A. I believe it would have been between 9:30 and 9:40
23	p.m.
24	Q. After 9:30 in the evening; right?
25	A. Yes, sir.

1 Q. Let me show you what has been admitted into 2 evidence as Exhibit 2334. 3 Do you remember noticing this particular 4 area of the crime scene? 5 Can I get up and take a look? Α. 6 Q. Please do. 7 Α. Yes, I do. 8 What's depicted in this particular photograph? Q. 9 In the upper right corner of the photograph is a Α. handprint that I had seen on the floor. 10 11 A bloody handprint? Q. 12 Yes, sir. Α. 13 Q. Is this the victim's body over to the left side of 14 the photograph? 15 Α. Yes, it is. 16 Do you know what this white spot is on the 17 victim's leg? 18 No, I do not. Α. 19 Were EMTs called to the scene? 0. 20 Α. They were. Were you there while they were there? 21 Q. 22 I was not in the room while they were there. I Α. 23 believe I had gone outside by that point. 24 Q. Did you notice blood spatter in the crime scene?

25

Α.

Yes, I did.

2 it? 3 Α. It was on the overturned shelves, on the wall 4 adjacent to the door and the closets, on the plastic tubs 5 just outside the door, across the top and the side of the 6 desk, as well as some on the chair that was by the exterior 7 door of the room. 8 Let me show you what is admitted into evidence as 9 Exhibit 2329. 10 Do you recognize what is depicted in that 11 particular photograph? 12 That would be the desk and office space. 13 Where was blood spatter located on the desk, to 14 your recollection? 15 Α. Across the corner nearest the door. The calendar 16 along the front, right around where the keyboard area would 17 be. 18 There is a laser pointer up there someplace. You Q. 19 can move to a different area and point to the areas where you 20 remember seeing blood spatter. 21 It was around here off of this corner. Across the 22 day planner here, and then I believe there may have been some 23 on the desk in this area also. 24 And then you indicated that there was also blood 25 spatter on the bookcases?

Where was blood spatter located when you noticed

1

0.

1	Α.	Yes. I do not remember seeing it on that
2	bookcase,	but on the other one.
3	Q.	The one that was laying down?
4	Α.	Yes, sir.
5	Q.	For the record this is Exhibit 2328.
6		You see the bookcase in the lower portion
7	of the pho	tograph?
8	Α.	Yes, I do.
9	Q.	Do you recall approximately where blood spatter
10	was locate	ed on that particular bookcase?
11	Α.	It was along the side here that was facing the
12	desk.	
13	Q.	After being in the office area and taking
14	photograph	as of the victim and the scene in that area, what
15	did you do)?
16	Α.	I exited out of the room and got with a couple
17	other depu	ties to clear the rest of the property.
18	Q.	When you were exiting the room, did you notice any
19	blood spat	ter in any locations in the hallway?
20	Α.	There was blood spatter on the tile flooring, as
21	well as th	ne plastic tubs that were stacked on the side at the
22	end of the	e hall.
23	Q.	The tile floor right outside the doorway?
24	Α.	Yes, sir.
25	Q.	And how about in the wall area going down the

1 hallway, did you see any blood spatter in the wall area? 2 I don't remember seeing any blood spatter in the 3 wall. 4 Did you activate any light switches when you were 5 in the crime scene? 6 No, I did not. Α. 7 So did you happen to notice a light switch in the 8 hallway area across from the doorway entering into the office 9 where the victim was located? 10 Α. It would have been just to the right. Yes, it was 11 just to the right of the bedroom, across the hall from the 12 office. 13 Q. Did you ever touch that light switch? 14 Α. No, I did not. 15 MR. BUTNER: We can go to a different 16 Thank you. situation now. 17 Judge, I am going to change gears a 18 little bit here. It might be a good time to take a break. THE COURT: It is about the time for the lunch 19 20 So remember the admonition, ladies and gentlemen. 21 will see you at 1:15. 1:15 is when we will try to resume. 22 (Whereupon, the jury exits the courtroom.) 23 (Whereupon, a recess was taken at 11:56 a.m. 24 to resume at 1:15 p.m. of the same day.)

<u>C E R T I F I C A T E</u>

I, ROXANNE E. TARN, CR, a Certified Reporter in the State of Arizona, do hereby certify that the foregoing pages 1 - 102 constitute a full, true, and accurate transcript of the proceedings had in the foregoing matter, all done to the best of my skill and ability.

SIGNED and dated this 9th day of July, 2010.

